1. **CALL TO ORDER / ROLL CALL**

The Regular Planning Commission meeting of January 9, 2019 was called to order by Chair Olson at 7:00 p.m.

Present: Planning Commissioners – Cummins, Gomes, Hennecke, Hicks, Kirsten, Slater and Chair Olson

Absent: Planning Commissioners –

Also Present: City Planner Craig Hoffman, Deputy City Attorney John Fukasawa, Deputy Public Works Director/City Engineer Lyman Chang and Department Secretary Kari Chadwick

2. **MINUTES**

"November 14, 2018"

**MOTION / VOTE:**

The Planning Commission, on motion of Commissioner Kirsten, Hicks second, unanimously approved the minutes of November 14, 2018 as written.

3. **PUBLIC HEARINGS**

a) Notice thereof having been published according to law, an affidavit of which publication is on file in the Community Development Department, Chair Olson called for the public hearing to consider the request of the Planning Commission to approve a Use Permit to allow a Banquet Hall that includes a Type-47 On-Sale Beer, Wine and Spirits for Friends Banquet Hall at 940 West Kettleman Lane. (Applicant: Rajinder Singh; File 2018-46 U; CEQA Determination: Exempt per Section 15321)

City Planner Craig Hoffman gave a brief presentation based on the staff report. Mr. Hoffman stated that an email letter was received and has been provided on Blue Sheet. He added that staff is recommending that a condition be added to the resolution in response to the concerns expressed in the email letter and that condition has also been provided on Blue Sheet. Staff is recommending approval of the project as conditioned in the draft resolution with the addition of Condition No. 48 as provided on Blue Sheet.

Commissioner Hennecke asked if resurfacing and striping are a part of that condition. Mr. Hoffman stated that the condition does not necessarily include complete parking lot rehab, but this property owner isn’t the only owner that has an interest in this parking lot. Mr. Hennecke expressed concerns over the lack of striping that designates the parking spaces.

**Hearing Opened to the Public**

- Paul Jaramillo, representative for the applicant Rajinder Singh, came forward to answer questions.

- Commissioner Kirsten asked how the applicant is going to go about getting the concerns address in the additional condition. Mr. Jaramillo stated that they will have to have a site meeting with the owners to go over the steps that will be taken to meet the new condition. Mr. Kirsten recommended that they invite F & M Bank to the meeting. Mr. Jaramillo stated that they will be inviting them.

- Chair Olson asked the applicant to keep City staff informed.
• Commissioner Gomes asked if the kitchen is already in the space. Mr. Jaramillo stated that it is not. He added that the kitchen will be more of a prep style kitchen to keep the food cooked at the restaurant warm and to give a clean-up area.

Public Portion of Hearing Closed

• Commissioner Kirsten asked how the new condition will get enforced. Mr. Hoffman stated that he will be doing an inspection prior to a Certificate of Occupancy being issued.

• Vice Chair Cummins asked if there is any leverage that the City has to enforce property owners to maintain their property. Mr. Hoffman stated that there are ways to give property owners incentive to clean up the property.

MOTION / VOTE:
The Planning Commission, on motion of Commissioner Slater, Hennecke second, finds that the project has satisfied the requirements of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Section 15321 and adopts a resolution approving a Use Permit to allow a Banquet Hall that includes a Type-47 On-Sale Beer, Wine and Spirits for Friends Banquet Hall at 940 West Kettleman Lane, subject to the findings and conditions of approval contained in the draft resolution with the addition of Condition 48 as provided on Blue Sheet. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners – Cummins, Gomes, Hennecke, Hicks, Kirsten, Slater and Chair Olson

Noes: Commissioners – None

Absent: Commissioners - None

b) Notice thereof having been published according to law, an affidavit of which publication is on file in the Community Development Department, Chair Olson called for the public hearing to consider the request of the Planning Commission to approve a Subdivision Map for the Twin Arbors Subdivision, a 5.42 acre, 28 unit subdivision at 2040 Cochran Road. (Applicant: Lodi Athletic Clubs; File: 2018-38 S; CEQA Status: Section 15332 – In-fill development consistent with the General Plan and Zoning Code)

City Planner Craig Hoffman gave a brief presentation based on the staff report. Staff is recommending approval of the project as conditioned in the draft resolution.

Commissioner Slater asked what a standard low density lot size is at this time. Mr. Hoffman stated a typical low density site is 50 or 60 feet by 90 feet. Mr. Slater asked what the width of the street will be. Mr. Hoffman stated that it is 32 feet.

Hearing Opened to the Public

• Larry Gilzean, applicant, came forward to answer questions.

• Chair Olson asked if the property is still for sale or is Twin Arbors looking to develop the property. Mr. Gilzean stated that they are not looking to develop the property and the property is for sale.

• Julia Teresi, local resident, came forward to express her concerns. She is concerned with the direction that this development will take the neighborhood. She added that she and her family looked for a long time for a well-established, quit and safe neighborhood to purchase their family home. Ms. Teresi stated that this will add at least 112 additional people and approximately 28 to 56 additional vehicles to the neighborhood. She stated that if this site is developed with houses there will not be a park within walking distance where she will feel safe with her children. Ms. Teresi does not feel this development will allow the neighborhood to stay safe for her family.
Commissioner Hennecke asked how many parking slots were used for Twin Arbors. Mr. Hoffman stated that the average vehicle trips that will be generated from this development is 224 (8 trips per residence) according to the International Traffic Engineers Association. The Club is currently creating 500 to 800 vehicles trips. Mr. Hoffman added that a trip is to and from the location. Commissioner Hennecke stated that there is a decrease in the traffic on a daily basis depending on the season. Mr. Hoffman stated that is correct. Ms. Teresi came forward to dispute the traffic numbers. She added that her house is not in the traffic path now, but it will be when this development is completed.

Carmelo Teresi, local resident, came forward to express additional concerns. He would like to see the development enter and exist straight with Peach Street rather than the two entrance and exit points.

Paul DeAndres, local resident, came forward to express concerns. Mr. DeAndres asked what is going on lot 29. Mr. Chang stated that it is a sewer lift station. Mr. DeAndres expressed displeasure with the fact that it will be right next to his residence. He added that he would also like to see the traffic ingress and egress line up with Peach Street.

Nora Olsen, local resident, came forward express concerns. She does not feel this is a good fit for this neighborhood. She added that there are several homes for sale in the neighborhood and they have been for sale for some time, so she does not think the area needs more homes for sale. Ms. Olsen stated that the pools that the City has available are not adequate for lap swimmers. She would like to see the City and the school district find a way to purchase the property and maintain it as an aquatic center. Commissioner Kirsten asked when Ms. Olson was made aware of the closure and then sale of the property. Ms. Olson stated she became aware in October of 2018 and was told at that time that the property was already sold.

Jo Sandlin, local resident, came forward to express concerns. She would like to see smart in-fill growth and she does not feel this development meets those criteria. Ms. Sandlin stated that the pool and tennis courts are not only used by the community but by Lodi High School and the Lodi Swim Club. She added that she and her husband have been living near this club for the last 28 years and they moved to this location to be near the club. Ms. Sandlin would like to see this location stay a recreational facility. She stated that many of the trips to and from the club are not from vehicles because many of the local residents walk to the club, some several times a day. She added that if for some reason this project is approved she would like to see the developer be required to put the utilities underground for the entire four blocks of Cochran Road.

Chair Olson asked if the developer can be required to put the utilities underground. Mr. Chang stated that the reason for not requiring this developer to put utilities underground is because if the City requires them to do it we will have to require any other person that wants to make improvements to their property to do the same.

Vic McClune, local resident, came forward to express concerns. He would like to see what the traffic restrictions will be placed on the development in regards to the surrounding streets. He added that Peach Street is unfinished and there have already been issues with club patrons speeding through the area. Mr. McClune feels this development will increase the traffic concerns. Mr. Chang stated that the residence on Willow and Peach have expressed concerns with having their streets improved. Mr. Hoffman added that at the time of annexation the residences on both Willow and Peach stated that they wanted the streets left alone.

John Vierra, local resident, came forward to express concerns. He handed out a map showing the lot sizes that are in the surrounding area, which Mr. Hoffman stated was in the meeting packet. Mr. Vierra stated that this map is not consistent with the surrounding neighborhood. He is concerned that if this map is approved tonight the Commission will lose leverage with the end product. There is no guarantee that this will be a beautiful community that will blend with what is existing. He would also like to see the utilities put underground. Mr. Vierra would also like to see the sidewalk along Cochran Road finished as part of this project as well. He added that he is not opposed to infill developments, but he is opposed to this one as presented. Commissioner Hennecke asked if Mr. Vierra is
opposed to this property being developed with homes. Mr. Vierra stated that he isn’t opposed to losing the club, but would like it replaced with something consistent. Mr. Hennecke asked what Mr. Vierra suggested to make the homes look consistent with an already aged neighborhood. Mr. Vierra stated that the neighborhood needs to give back to the existing neighborhood in some way, by either ensuring that the dwellings will attract a price level that is consistent with the neighborhood or by offering a small park area within the development. Mr. Hennecke stated that his experience says that a builder will want to develop this property with the thought of trying to get top dollar. Mr. Vierra stated his appreciation for the comment and reiterated his desire to see the lot sizes become more consistent with the surround area.

- Commissioner Kirsten stated that economics tends to ignore emotions. He encouraged the audience to develop a committee to possibly purchase and run the club if it is important to the neighbors.

- Chair Olson asked for clarification from Mr. Vierra regarding the idea of developing the property, but just has an issue with the lot size. Mr. Vierra stated that is correct. Ms. Olson asked staff if there is a possibility to increase the size of the lots. Mr. Hoffman stated that it would be up to the applicant taking the map back to the engineer and removing some lots and seeing if it pencils out.

- Commissioner Hennecke asked what the lot sizes in Rose Gate look like. Mr. Hoffman stated the lots range from 4500 to 5500 and long the canal and western edge they range from 6000 to 7000 plus.

- Ron and Keri Hilder, local residents, came forward to express concerns. Ms. Hilder stated that she would like to see the map be more consistent with the surrounding neighborhood with 55 foot roadways and a minimum of 7000 square foot lot sizes. She encouraged the Commission to force the current owner and future developer to build a development that would be consistent with what is directly adjacent to the property. Ms. Hilder stated that there are CC&R’s for the Sunwest One area and she would be happy to provide those to staff to encourage the developer to use them to develop this area. She added that the Club owner asked and got a condition placed on the lots that are directly adjacent to the club property not allowing them to build two-story dwellings when the map was approved. Mr. Hilder stated his agreement with what his wife has stated. He added that safety for the children walking to Vinewood School is a problem with there not being any sidewalks on Peach Street.

- Commissioner Hennecke stated that he is not a fan of the new developments with the narrow streets. He asked staff if the Commission has the discretion to require wider streets and larger lots. Mr. Hoffman stated that the Commission does have that ability. Mr. Slater stated his agreement with Commissioner Hennecke.

- Ron Butler, local resident, came forward to express his concerns. Mr. Butler stated that conditions were placed on the homes that are directly adjacent with the club property that would not allow them to build two-story homes and now they are proposing sites to build what they have been unable to build. He would like to see the property lines line up with the existing properties that are directly adjacent.

- Ron Heberle, Lodi resident, came forward to express concerns. Mr. Heberle stated that he was a local firefighter in Lodi for many years and appreciates the Commissioner’s view on narrow streets. He added that they have always been a rough area for the trucks to go down especially if there are cars parked on both sides of the street. Mr. Hennecke asked staff if the Fire Department reviewed the map. Mr. Hoffman stated that they have reviewed and approve of the map as presented.

Public Portion of Hearing Closed

- Vice Chair Cummins asked Mr. Gilzean to come forward to answer some questions. Mr. Cummins stated that he lives in the Rose Gate community and he feels that it is a very pedestrian friendly neighborhood. Mr. Gilzean came forward. Mr. Cummins asked Mr. Gilzean his relation to the property owner. Mr. Gilzean stated that he is a member of the
Spare Time team which is a partner in Lodi Athletics Club. He added that the club has closed due to the economics and this property did not make any sense to continue to operate at this location. Mr. Gilzean stated that they did market the location to other fitness operations and when they were not interested in purchasing the site they decided to go in the direction of creating a subdivision to market.

- Commissioner Hennecke asked if the owners would be financially burdened if the Commission to reduce the lot sizes. Mr. Gilzean stated that the map started out with more lots than what was presented tonight and staff requested the number of lots be reduced.

- Steve Peachin, Baubach and Piazza, came forward to address some of the engineering questions. Cochran Road sits higher than the property which required the pump station. Mr. Peachin stated that part of the conditions will require that all of the sidewalks adjacent to the property to bring them up to ADA standards. He added that the average lot size is brought down by the interior lots, but the outside lots are comparable. Mr. Peachin stated that there are property owners that have split lots in the vicinity that have been in-line with the zoning and not the neighborhood. Mr. Hennecke asked for clarification that the need for the lift station being necessary because of the elevation of the street is substantially higher than the proposed development. Mr. Peachin stated that is correct.

- Mr. Hennecke asked staff for clarification regarding the roadways being a private development. Mr. Hoffman stated that it will be a private development.

- Chair Olson stated that she would like to see the applicant do a little more work on this project and come back with something a little more conforming to the neighborhood.

- Commissioner Kirsten agreed with Chair Olson and cannot support the map as presented.

- Commissioner Slater also agreed with his fellow Commissioners.

- Vice Chair Cummins asked what the street width as proposed. Mr. Hoffman stated 32 feet. Mr. Cummins stated that he disagrees with his fellow Commissioners.

- Commissioner Hicks stated that she is a local contractor and developer and feels she is in a difficult spot. She would like to see this development be more consistent with the surrounding neighborhood.

- Commissioner Gomes stated her agreement with Vice Chair Cummins and feels that they are conforming to the current General Plan and the entire surrounding neighborhood.

- Commissioner Hennecke asked what the options are for a motion at this time. Mr. Hoffman stated that the project can be approved or tabled to give staff a chance to work with the applicant.

**MOTION / VOTE:**
The Planning Commission, on motion of Commissioner Hennecke, Slater second, tabled and directed staff to continue working with the applicant for the proposed Subdivision Map for the Twin Arbors Subdivision, a 5.42 acre, 28 unit subdivision at 2040 Cochran Road. The motion carried by the following vote:

- **Ayes:** Commissioners – Cummins, Gomes, Hennecke, Hicks, Kirsten, Slater and Chair Olson
- **Noes:** Commissioners – None
- **Absent:** Commissioners - None

4. **PLANNING MATTERS/FOLLOW-UP ITEMS**
   None

5. **ANNOUNCEMENTS AND CORRESPONDENCE**
   None
6. **ACTIONS OF THE CITY COUNCIL**
   None

7. **ACTIONS OF THE SITE PLAN AND ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMITTEE**
   Mr. Hoffman gave a brief report regarding recent meetings. Commissioner Slater stated that the Committee was very supportive of the architecture of the most recent projects that are in that area.

8. **ACTIONS OF THE LODI ART COMMISSION**
   Commissioner Kirsten gave a brief report regarding recent meetings.

9. **COMMENTS BY THE PUBLIC (NON-AGENDA ITEMS)**
   None

10. **COMMENTS BY STAFF AND COMMISSIONERS (NON-AGENDA ITEMS)**
    Commissioner Hennecke asked for more information from staff regarding future street widths to help the Commission make more informed decisions. Mr. Hoffman stated that during the General Plan update staff received some pushback from the State to have less impervious services. He added that the streets were not meant to be the parking lots for residential homes. Mr. Hoffman stated that he has anxiety with the fact that people do not park their cars in their garage and understands that the large pickup trucks or SUVs aren't able to fit in a standard garage. Mr. Chang stated that Planning and Public Works worked together to get the minimum width increased to 36 feet.

11. **ADJOURNMENT**
    There being no further business to come before the Planning Commission, the meeting was adjourned at 9:30 p.m.

    ATTEST:

    Kari Chadwick
    Planning Commission Secretary